ON THE COUNTABILITY
OF A SET OF REAL NUMBERS (*)

by ALEXANDER ABIAN (in Ames) (**)

SOMMARIO. - Si dimostra che se ogni sottoinsieme numerabile di un
insieme $S$ di numeri reali è sommabile, allora $S$ è numerabile.
Poggiando su ciò si dà una originale dimostrazione della nume-
rabilità di insiemi di sequenze ortonormali.

SUMMARY. - It is shown that if every countable subset of a set $S$ of
real numbers is summable then $S$ is countable. Based on this an
original proof of the countability of any set of orthonormal se-
quence is given.

To the knowledge of the author Theorem 1 below which states a
rather basic property of real numbers has not appeared in the litera-
ture. Based on Theorem 1 a new set-theoretical proof (in contra-
distinction to the known function-theoretic proofs) is given of the
countability of any orthonormal set of infinite real sequences.

In what follows $\omega$ stands for the first infinite ordinal and $\omega_1$ for
the first uncountable ordinal. We need the following obvious lemma.

LEMMA 1. - Let $W$ be a set of real numbers such that $W$ is well
ordered by the usual order of the real numbers. Then $W$ is countable.

Proof. Let us assume to the contrary that $W$ is uncountable. But

(*) Pervenuto in Redazione il 30 giugno 1985.
(**) Indirizzo dell’Autore: Department of Mathematics - Iowa State University -
Ames, Iowa 50011 (U.S.A.).
then uncountably many rational numbers can be chosen each located between a pair of consecutive elements of $W$. This contradicts the fact that there are contably many rational numbers.

**Theorem 1.** - Let $S$ be a set of real numbers such that every countable subset of $S$ is summable. Then $S$ is countable.

**Proof.** Let us assume to the contrary that $S$ is uncountable. But then $S$ would have a subset $S_1$ all of whose elements are of the same sign, say, positive and such that $S_1$ is in one-to-one correspondence with $\omega_1$. Let us recall that $\omega_1$ has uncountably many countable initial segments and that the set of these initial segments is well ordered by the set-theoretical inclusion. Since every countable subset of $S_1$ is a summable subset of positive real numbers we may consider the set $W$ whose elements are the sums of those subsets of $S_1$ which (by virtue of the above one-to-one correspondence) are in one-to-one correspondence with an initial segment of $\omega_1$. But then, clearly, $W$ would be an uncountable subset of the real numbers which is well ordered by the usual order of the real numbers, contradicting Lemma 1. Thus, our assumption is false and the Theorem is proved.

As shown below, Theorem 1 provides a novel (and perhaps quite original proof of the following classical result [1, p. 237] of the Hilbert Space of the square summable (real) sequences.

**Theorem 2.** - Let $N$ be an orthonormal set of (countably) infinite sequences of real numbers. Then $N$ is countable.

**Proof.** Let us assume to the contrary that $N$ is uncountable. Let $N_1$ be a subset of $N$ such that $N_1$ is in one-to-one correspondence with $\omega_1$. Let $M$ be an $\omega_1$ by $\omega$ matrix whose rows are the elements $r_1, r_2, r_3, \ldots, r_i, \ldots$ (for $i \in \omega_1$) of $N_1$. Let $M$ be given by:

$$
M = \begin{bmatrix}
a_{11} & a_{12} & a_{13} & \cdots & a_{1j} & \cdots \\
a_{21} & a_{22} & a_{23} & \cdots & a_{2j} & \cdots \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots & \vdots \\
a_{i1} & a_{i2} & a_{i3} & \cdots & a_{ij} & \cdots \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots & \vdots 
\end{bmatrix}
$$

for $i \in \omega_1$ and $j \in \omega$.

Let us denote by $e_i$ the $\omega$ by 1 matrix which is the transpose of the matrix $(1, 0, 0, \ldots)$. Clearly, the inner product $r_i \cdot e_1$ is the length of the projection of $e_1$ on $r_i$. Moreover,

(1) \hspace{1cm} r_i \cdot e_1 = a_{i1} \text{ for } i \in \omega_1.

Now, let us consider the set $S$ of the squares of the elements of the first column of $M$, i.e.,

(2) \hspace{1cm} S = \{a_{11}^2, a_{21}^2, a_{31}^2, \ldots, a_{n1}^2, \ldots\} \text{ for } i \in \omega_1.
We claim that every countable subset \( C \) of \( S \) is summable. This is because from (1) it follows that the elements of \( C \) are the squares of the lengths of the projections of \( e_1 \) on the elements of a denumerable orthonormal set \( C \). Thus, by Bessel's inequality [2, pp. 15-17] the sum of the squares of the elements of \( C \) is less than or equal to 1 which is equal to the square of the length of \( e_1 \). Hence, every countable subset of \( S \) given by (2) is summable and therefore, by Theorem 1, the set \( S \) is countable. But then since the first column of \( M \) has at most twice as many distinct elements as \( S \) does, we see that the first column of \( M \) has countably many distinct elements. Consequently, for a countable ordinal \( \alpha \) we have:

\[
(3) \quad a_{\alpha,1} = a_{\alpha 1} \text{ with } \alpha_1 \in \omega_1 \text{ for } \alpha > \alpha_1.
\]

Now, let us consider \( e_j \) instead of \( e_1 \) where \( e_j \) is the transpose of the matrix \((0,0,\ldots,1,0,0,\ldots)\) with 1 at the \( j \)-th coordinate. But then with a reasoning analogous to the case of \( e_1 \) we derive (in accordance with (3)) that for a countable ordinal \( \alpha \) we have:

\[
(4) \quad a_{\alpha,j} = a_{\alpha,j} \text{ with } \alpha_j \in \omega_1 \text{ and } j \in \omega \text{ for } \alpha > \alpha_j.
\]

Finally, let \( u = \sup \{ \alpha_j | j \in \omega \} \). Clearly, \( u \) is a denumerable ordinal and from (4) it follows that for the rows \( r_\nu \) and \( r_\alpha \) of \( M \), we have:

\[
(5) \quad r_\nu = r_\alpha \text{ for } \nu \in \omega_1 \text{ with } \nu > \alpha.
\]

But then (5) implies that \( M \) has only countably many distinct rows which is a contradiction since by our assumption \( M \) has uncountably many (in fact \( \omega_1 \)) distinct rows. Thus, our assumption is false and the Theorem is proved.

REFERENCES